AUTHOR	YEAR COUNTRY	HOST	PHYTOPHTHORA SPECIES	LABORATORY / GLASSHOUSE / FIELD
D'Souza.A.A	2005 Australia	Banksia grandis	P. cinnamomi	Glasshouse
Joo. G	2005 Korea	Capsicum annuum (Red Pepper)	P. capsici	In vitro inhibition assay / Glasshouse
Jung. W. J	2005 Korea		P. capsici	Glasshouse in vivo
Rajkumar. M	2005 South Korea	Capsicum annuum	P. capsici	In vitro dual culture, detached leaf assa
Ezziyyani. M	2007 Spain	Capsicum annuum	P. capsici	In vitro, in vivo - nursery
Lee J.K	2008 South Korea	Capsicum annuum	P. capsici	In vitro challenge assay. In vivo
Sang. M. Y	2008 Korea	Capsicum annuum cv Nockwang	P. capsici	In vitro / in planta (Glasshouse presuma
Alexander.B.J.R	2001 New Zealand	Malus domestica	P. cactorum	Glasshouse
Kim. S.G	2010 Korea		P. capsici	In vitro
Segarra et al	2013 Spain	Capsicum annuum	P. capsici	Growth Chamber as well as Greenhous
A. Faye, et al	2013 Kenya	Zea mays L.	N/A	Green House.
Ozyilmaz. U	2013 Turkey	Capsicum annuum var California Wonder	P. capsici	In vitro/Greenhouse
Liu. H	2014 China	Capsicum annuu m var Bian'jiae No.1	P. capsici strain BP05	Nursery
Mbarga. J. B	2014 Cameroon	Theobroma cacao	P. megakarya EL1	In vitro. Field test.
Widmer. T	2014 USA		P. ramorum	In vitro dual culture, soil bioassay
Victoria-Arellano.A.D. Et al	2015 Mexico	Capsicum annuum L. Serrano	P. capsici	In vitro challenge assay
Hung, et al	2015 Thailand	Pomelo - Citrus maxima	P. nicotianae	In vitro / in vivo
Hung. P.M et al	2015 Thailand	Citrus maxima	P. palmivora	In vitro challenge assay, crude extract a
Dianez Martinez.F.	2016	Capsicum annuum L. cv, Acorde RZF1	Many. + P. capsici and P. parasitica	Nursery/Greenhouse
Yao. Y	2016 China	Potato cv Favorita	P. infestans	In vitro dual culture / Glasshouse / Field
Bae. SJ, et al.	2016 Korea	Capsicum annum cv Bugang, Solanum lycoper	r P. cactorum, P. capsici, P. dreschleri, P. infestans, P. melonis, P. nicotianae, P. sojae	Petri Dish
Bhai. RS, Et al	2016 India	Piper nigrum var Sreekara	P. capsici	In vitro, then glasshouse
Garcia-Nunez. H	2017 Mexico		P. infestans	In vitro
Zhang. M	2016 China	Capsicum annuum var Bola No.5	P. capsici	in vitro / in vivo (Glasshouse presumab
Jing et al.	2017 China	Tobacco - Small Gold 1025.	P. nicotianae	In vitro. Field Trial.
Kowalska.J	2017 Poland	Potato, not specified what variety	P. infestans	Greenhouse and Field Trials
Lu, et al.	2017 China	Soybean	P. sojae isolate P6497 Race 2	Leaf dip then P. sojae introduction. "Gr
Morrison, et al	2017 Canada	Solanum tuberosum	P. infestans	In vitro confrontational assays. Direct p
Raut.I et al	2017 Romania	Capsicum annuum cv Lamuyo	P. parasitica	In vitro / in vivo
Reyes-Tena et all	2017 Mexico	Capsicum annuum - Poblano "San Luis" variet		Greenhouse - Then Field
Ros. M	2017 Spain	Capsicum annuum cv Lamuyo	P. nicotianae	
Тауо. Р	2017 Cameroon	Theobroma cacao	P. megakarya	Greenhouse - Then Field
Tchameni. S. N	2017 Cameroon	Theobroma cacao SNK213	P. megakarya	In vitro / Maybe greenhouse? They don
Uc-Arguelles. A	2017 Mexico	Capsicum annuum var Jalapeno M	P. capsici	In vitro / greenhouse
Villamizar-Gallardo. R	2017 Colombia	Theobroma cacao L	P. palmivora	In vitro
Widmer, Et al	2017 USA	Viburnum tinus	P. ramorum isolate CDFA 83-2	Greenhouse - Then Field
Zhang.S et al	2017 China	Potato, not specified what variety	P. infestans	In vitro/planta style assay.
Alaux. P, et al	2018 Europe/Belgium	Solanum tuberosum	P. infestans	Greenhouse - Then Field
Arfaoui, et al	2018 Manitoba - Canada	Soybean	P. sojae	Glasshouse
Corato et al	2018 Italy	Lycopersicum esculantum for P. nicotianae	Pythium ultimum, Rhizoctonia solani, P. nicotianae, Verticillium dahliae, Fusarium o	
de Vries, et al	2018 Germany	Solanum lycopersicum cv. M82	9 X P. infestans isolates	in vitro + in planta
El-Sayed et al	2018 USA	Smilax bona-nox	P. parasitica	In vitro. Paper disc diffusion assay.
Khalaf and Raizada	2018 Egypt		Rhizoctonia solani, Fusarium graminearum, Phytophthora capsici, Pythium aphanid	
Mendez-Bravo, et al	2018 Mexico		P. cinnamomi	In vitro.
Mmbaga, et al	2018 USA	Capsicum annum cy Pepper Cavenne, Numex	P. capsici, P. nicotianae, P. irrigata, P. cryptogea. Fusarium solani, Fusarium oxyspo	
Nawaz, et al	2018 Pakistan	Capsicum annum	P. capsici	In vitro, greenhouse.
Ndoungue, et al.	2018 Cameroon	Theobroma cacao	P. megakarya	Field Conditions
Ramirez-Delgado, et al	2018 Mexico		2 X Mexican <i>P. capsici</i> isolates RDP-1 RDP-2	in vitro dual culture
Sanchez San Fulgencio et al	2018 Spain	Capsicum annuum L., var. Sweet Italian	P. capsici, Rhizoctonia solani, Fusarium oxysporum f.sp melonis, Pythium ultimum	In vitro, dual culture. In vivo Greenhous
Sanchez-Cruz.R et al	2019 Mexico	Mimosa pudica	P. capsici	In vitro challenge assay
Sang, et al	2018 Korea	Presumably C. annuum	P. capsici	Indoor Grow room, sterile medium
Thuerig.B	2018 Switzerland		P. infestans	In vitro - 96well plate. Germination rate
Uddin.M	2018 Pakistan	Lycopersicum esculantum	P. capsici	In vitro/Greenhouse
Wagner, et al	2018 USA	-, coperoioun coonantain	P. sojae. Pythium heterothalicum, Pythium irregulare, Pythium sylvaticum, Pythium	-
	2010 000			
	2018 USA	Nursery soil	P. ramorum isolate CDFA 83-2	Nursery/Actual Field Trial
Widmer, Et al Wu.L. Et al	2018 USA 2018 China	Nursery soil Nicotiana benthamiana	P. ramorum isolate CDFA 83-2 P. nicotianae	Nursery/Actual Field Trial In planta assays

ssay and Petri disl

umably) / Field Te

ouse

ct assay

ield Trial

nably)

"Greenhouse" Tria ct potato tuber inc

don't state where

ouse with P. capsi

rates. Glasshouse

say

DIRECT OR INDIRECT EFFECT	
	BIO CONTROL ORGANISM Fifteen legume species. Acacia alata, A. drummondii, A. extensa, A. lateriticola, A. pulchella, A. stenoptera, A. urophylla, Bossiaea aqui
Indirect. "the anti-fungal activity against the pathogen mainly origina	
unknown	Paenibacillus illinoisensis KJA-424
h based seedling assay. In vivo greenhouse assay.	Fluorescent pseudomonads isolated from red pepper rhizosphere.
unknown	Trichoderma harzianum + Streptomyces rochei
unknown	Bacillus subtilis isolated from the rhizosphere of healthy Red Pepper plants growing in P. capsici infected soil
unknown	"Bacteria isolated from rhizosphere soils, root surfaces, and root interiors of cucumber, pepper and tomato plants" 439 isolated, 16 se
unknown	Ten promising fungi selected through a series of selective screenings. Fusarium oxysporum, Microsphaeropsis sp. Oidiodendron sp. Pa
Suggested antibiosis.	Paenibacillus polymyxa and Bacillus subtilis
Potential induction of plant defenses.	Trichoderma asperellum T34
N/A	Commercial AMF products
Indirect. Surfactant production	Mostly Pseudomonas fluorescens
unknown	Bacillus subtilis AR12, Bacillus subtilis SM21 and Chryseobacterium sp. R89
unknown	Trichoderma asperellum PR11 with a novel oil dispersion formulation
Direct mycoparasitism	12 Trichoderma asperellum isolates. 2 T. virens . Plus T. koningiopsis and T. martiale .
unknown	3X Trichoderma spp isolated from crop rhizosphere
Direct mycoparasitism	Chaetomium globosum CG05, Chaetomium lucknowense CL01, Chaetomium cupreum CC3003
unknown	Chaetomium globosum, Chaetomium cupreum, Chaetomium lucknowense
unknown Direct museus activitien	Trichoderma saturnisporum Trichoderma harzianum
Direct mycoparasitism	
Molecular, direct. Hypothesized cell wall interference/degradation. Ge No hypothesis proposed	Actinomycetes/Streptomycetes
unknown	10 native <i>Trichoderma</i> isolates. Six were 99% identical to <i>T. asperellum</i> , the other four were 99% identical to <i>T. harzianum</i> .
unknown	76 bacteria were isolated, 23 were selected for further analysis. The strong antagonistic isolate was further characterized and identifie
Direct mycoparasitism	Syringa oblata essential oil. Primary constituent: eugenol.
unknown	Bacillus subtilis (Serenade ASO)
Indirect. Stimulation of hydrogen peroxide activity and callose deposit	
Indirect. Antibiotic phenazine-1-carboxylic acid (PCA).	Pseudomonas fluorescens LBUM636
No hypothesis proposed	Trichoderma asperellum T36, Trichoderma asperellum T50, Trichoderma harzianum T78
unknown	AMF "Cerro del Metate Consortium. What this contains isn't described. + 4 X Actinomycetes.
unknown	Compost amended with Trichoderma harzianum + Trichoderma asperellum
Potential stimulation of plant defense mechanisms and metabolites by	(Chitosan and/or snail shells
Mycoparasitism. Tested whether P. megakarya could be recovered from	rr Trichoderma asperellum PR10, PR11, PR12, PR659-7
Direct mycoparasitism	Saccharicola sp.
Direct mycoparasitism	Trichoderma viride and Botryosphaeria quercum
Not stated	Trichoderma asperellum 04-22
unknown	Melatonin
Indirect	Rhizophagus irregularis (AMF)
Indirect	Various bacteria isolated from healthy soybean roots. Four isolates, S1, S9, S10 and S11. Seed coat inoculum. S1- Paenibacillus, S9-10-
unknown	Compost / Compost Extract
Indirect	12 host derived fungal endophytes. Ascomycetes. Phoma eupatorii identified as most effective. Pyrenochaeta cava (85% identity) Mo
Ruled out that it's unlikely due to swarming motility, HCN production,	
Production of diffusible and volatile compounds by A8a.	ea 169 curcubit bacterial seed endophytes. Mostly Bacillus, some Paenibacillus, Enterobacteriaceae, Cronobacter, Pantoea, Microbacte
· · ·	Avocado tree rhizosphere sampling. <i>Bacillus</i> sp. A8a Endophytes - <i>Nigrospora sphaerica</i> A22F1
Not stated. unknown	Trichoderma harzianum, T. viride, T. reesei
unknown	Trichoderma asperellum PR11
Phytophthora parasitisation by Trichoderma	Trichoderma harzianum Th-7, Trichoderma koningiopsis Tk NRRL50190, Trichoderma asperellum Ta NRRL50191
	s. Bacteria isolated from compost, then screened for chitinolytic activity. <i>Geobacillus thermodenitrifican</i> s 3750 and <i>Bacillus aerius</i> 3358
unknown	Root nodule isolated bacteria. Identified as <i>Enterobacter</i> spp and <i>Serratia</i> spp
Phosphate-solubilising and plant growth-promoting rhizobacterium.	
Identified the two neolignans honokiol and magnolol as main active of	
Mycelium lysis	Trichoderma harzianum
Competition through iron acquisition by siderophores. "suggesting d	
"The mode of action for most T. asperellum isolates and isolate 04-22	
Regulation of stomatal Opening and SA-JA-ET-signalling pathways are	es Bacillus amyloliquefaciens FZB42
unknown	Streptomyces

"Acacia pulchella, A stenoptera, A. extensa, A. alata are species that have a high potential for biological control of P. cinnamomi." These Acacia species reduced the inoculum level within soils.

"The present results suggest that the seedling assay can be used as a rapid and more accurate technique than detached leaves assay for selecting effective antagonists against soil bore infection of P. capsici in pepper." Combined BCA result of ~75%+ inhibition. "The main conclusion is that the antagonists, T. harzianum and S. rochei, despite belonging to different genera, are synergic and can be added together to produce a greater effect on the pathogen." "Interestingly the isolates R13, R19 R36 and R41 exhibited less inhibition in dual culture assay, and were more efficient in controlling the disease severity under in vivo conditions." elected through sequential selection protocol

T. harzianum noted as particularly effective. "In general the bacterial and actinomycete isolates performed poorly compared with the fungal isolates." However "Flavobacterium sp. B219 provided the best overall control of P. cactorum on rootstocks." Examined the CFU count versus the label count. Found 9.9X10 to the 7 and 1.3X 10 to the 8, compared to the stated 1X10 to the seven and 5X 10 to the 6. The products contained the stated organisms. Effective as a preventative in the soil prior to inoculation, but also effective when co inoculated with P. capsici.

11 AMF fungi declared within the inoculants by producer. 13 AMF spore's were recovered and identified. Five of which were not listed as part of the commercial inoculants. "..there were few matches between claimed and trapped species. In the non-inoculated pot treatment no AMF spores were detected."

Biocontrol of P. capsici with consortia was much more effective than control using any of the three species individually. 81.81% efficacy compared to 60.73% for a solo. Good shelf life stability, unique formulation. Good field results. Sprayed trees'/pods had strong resistance to P. megakarya, the formulation perfor "Results from this study demonstrated that some of the isolates tested have the capacity to remediate soil infested with P. ramorum by eliminating or significantly reducing viable P. ramorum propagules."

"Approximately 300 g of dry biomass of Chaetomiumspecies will yield approximately 20 g of crude MeOH [12]. In contrast, a single PDA plate harbouring 4-wk-old C.globosum yields hundreds of millions of spores [26]. Thus, mixing of spores from these antagonists with potting mediato control root rot in pome Investigation into inhibition of sporangial production.

"Extracts caused significant morphological changes in Phytophthora hyphae, including swelling, knotting, crumpling, flattening, shrivelling, bursting and necrosis"

Inhibition ranging from 49% to 98%

d as Bacillus amyloliquefaciens

"..the eugenol emulsion as a natural pesticide has no resides and is environmentally friendly..." Sp. Residues.

Chitosan and snail shell increased germination rate significantly. "This study shows that the incidence of disease was significantly reduced in plants obtained from soils treated with chitosan or snail shell. Under controlled conditions, chitosan and snail shell we efficient elicitors of some defense reactions in c

"...T. asperellum isolate 04-22 does not only protect V. tinus roots from P. ramorum infection, but it can reduce secondary inoculum from already infected roots."

"...exogenous application of melatonin significantly attenuated the potato late blight by inhibiting mycelial growth, changing cell ultrastructure, reducing the virulence and impairing stress tolerance of P. infestans. Importantly, melatonin reduced the doses and enhanced the effects of fungicide for potato lat 50% inhibition

Potentially plant growth promoting as well.

nosporascus ibericus (97% identity)

"Of the forty tested isolates, twelve displayed significant activity against the tested fungi (data not shown). " " ...only two Pseudomonas isolates of P. parasitica" " These four isolates also displayed comparable antimicrobial activity against four additional Phytophthora s A particular cultivar of Melon gave rise to the highest count of endophytic bacteria that showed protective effects.

identified as most promising

Identification of T. harzianum within the host plants "...the biological control agent entered into the epidermis and cortex region of root tissue. Mycelium and dark round spores of T. harzianum were seen in those regions." "Overall, P. sojae was the most susceptible and was inhibited by 103 bacterial strains." "Significantly, there were more aquatic than soil isolates that were antagonistic..."

"Applying FZB42 to the roots of N. benthamiana plats reduced the severity of the disease caused by P. nicotianae and inhibited proliferation of the pathogen in the leaves, even though B. amyloliquefaciens FZB42 only colonizes the roots."

Yes

"The broth of S. halstedi i AJ-7 suppressed the growth of Phytophthora capsic i with less than 1% survival of the pathogen after 12 h treatment."

Dual culture in vivo results showed that inoculation with P. illinoisensis gave similar plant biomass results as the negative water control, a significant difference compared to the reduction in plant biomass from inoculation with P. capsici. Positive results in all assay undertaken, however these results were not consistent within isolates tested. "In conclusion, the isolate PS119 have proved to be efficient in the control of Phytophthora blight of pepper in the in vivo biocontrol assay..." Yes

Positive results in all assay undertaken, however these results were not consistent within isolates tested.

"In conclusion, the antagonistic bacterial strains selected through the sequential screening procedure appeared to provide significant protection against the soilborne oomycete pathogen, P. capsici, through pepper root colonization." Yes

"The microbial fungicides examined in our study showed no significant reduction of the pepper disease caused by P. capsici, compared to the inoculated control. " "MAP (P. polymyxa) was effective grominently against zoospore germination, while MBB (B. subtilis) only was effective against mycelia growth o Growth Chamber, 71% reduction in disease. Greenhouse, ~40-50% reduction in disease severity.

"Inoculation of commercial mycorrhizal products did not allow significant total dry biomass increases of maize plant compared to control treatment."

Yes. Greenhouse results = 48.4% - 61.3% disease control. Application in conjunction with olive oil showed significant improvement of disease control. Up to 81.1% control.

Yes

Yes.

Yes. Strong results in dual culture assay.

Yes, the study didn't present all the results in regards to effectiveness. However they do state that eight of the strains showed at least 50% inhibition.

~50-70% reduction in growth rate in in vitro.

Yes. ~50-60% inhibition. >92% sporangium inhibition. "All the tested crude extracts exhibited stronger inhibitory effects on sporangium formation than on mycelial growth..."

Yes >80% inhibition. T. saturnisporum significantly reduced plant mortality and disease severity compared to water controls

Dual culture = 30 - 60% inhibition. Disease severity was significantly reduced in greenhouse trials, by more than half reduction in some. Field trials, by more than half reduction in some. Field trials, by more than half reduction by lance severity in potato plants compared to the control during field trials." Results show disease reduction by lance severity in potato plants compared to the control during field trials. Yes, 8 Trichoderma isolates showed 100% inhibitory activity

Low level minimization of root infection

Yes

77.72% disease control in *in vivo* experiment.

~60% - 100% inhibition.

"It has been found that B. subtilis has the potential to protect against P. infestans when it was applied as preventative treatments, in field conditions the protective effect occurs only after 6 treatments and is comparable to that with copper." Yes, ~ 50-60% disease inhibition. "B. altitudinis JSCX-1 isolated from ahealthy soybean rhizosphere triggered plant resistanceagainst P. sojae by an SA-dependent signalling pathway."

Yes, not quantified as a percentage.

Yes, from 77.7% to 81.2% inhibition in dual culture experiment. Somewhat good results in in vivo

Somewhat.

Moderate success, fewer dead seedlings when grown in amended compost. However the results do not seem large.

Yes

Yes, at least 50% reduction of disease

Yes. Inhibition of 44.8% of P. capsici. In vitro. Greenhouse test was a failure, with 100% mortality

Yes, strong biocontrol of P. palmivora with B. quercum, with a biological control index value of 82.3%

Yes.

Yes

Low

Promising. S1 and S11 showed a 70% and 50% disease reduction on plates. Both allowed for a disease reduction in greenhouse trials.

Some. Up to 78% suppression.

"The presence of Pho. eupatorii not only reduced or inhibited thepathogen's growth, but perhaps entirely prevented infection."

More than 80% inhibition of mycelia.

Some suppression identified.

46% - 76% mycelial growth inhibition by A8a

Yes, ~40 - 60% reduction in disease severity.

In vitro - ~40-80% inhibition. Greenhouse trials ~10-20 reduction in severity in already infected plants.

"The work presentedhere shows that, although soil applications with T. asperellum PR11 andRidomil Gold did not significantly reduce the total number of diseasedpods, nor overall pod rot rate, soil applications are capable of changing disease dynamics by reducing the speed in which the disease progresses" Minor reduction in growth rate.

Minimal success in In vivo

Serratia were able to inhibit fungal growth. No data given about percentage inhibition or effectiveness.

Yes, 50% reduction

Yes

Yes.

Yes

Soil remediation: Spring success, fall failure

Yes, 60% inhibition

NOTES

Study investigatin whether legume plants may be used to remediate area's and potentially restrict spread or reduce the pathogen load in soils due to resistence.

Assessing culture broth of S. halstedii as a BCA

Investigated the plant defense proteins upregulated in response to infection.

Investigating using two BCA as a single formulation

Sequential selection protocol. Lengthy article with a good amount of data and statistics.

Screening 624 BCAs. 504 fungi and 120 bacteria and actinomycetes. Samples isolated from apple orchard sites and some non-orchard sites in Auckland, Hawke's Bay and Nelson. This was narrowed down to Examining the effectiveness of two commercial BCA, each containing one of Paenibacillus polymyxa and Bacillus subtilis

Molecular focused

This article is assessing the composition and effectiveness of commercial AMF inocula and whether it might establish in soil. Screened 101 isolates obtained from rhizosphere, 24 showed inhibition of P. capsici, 15 of these inhibited by more than 50%. Study explores a mixed BCA consortium as BC of P. capsici but also as BC of a mix of pathogens: R. solanacearum, P. capsici and M. incognita

Investigating a novel oil based T. asperellum formulation. Assessed shelf life.

This study spent more time characterizing the Trichoderma growth profiles rather than the inhibitory effects.

Generally solid article, the controls could have been better but otherwise seems decently put together. Crude extracts of Chaetomium sp.'s were also tested. Measured sporangial production inhibition

Exploration of a new Trichoderma species. T. saturnisporum. Investigation into inhibition effects as well as volatile compounds produced.

In Vitro, Glasshouse then Field Trial.

Detailed molecular analysis, including gene expression data for both Host and Pathogen

Dodgy methodology. Lots of uncontrolled variables. Article largely focuses on growth promotion and characterization of microbes, less on inhibition. Fairly simple study characterizing the control effectiveness of native Trichoderma strains.

Study investigating a plant derived compound: Eugenol. Trial of commercial BCA, one which is used here in NZ.

Molecular methods and good experimental design showed that PCA was the main causative agent in protection. Short succinct article.

Somewhat confusingly written in general. The study wasn't particularly well designed either.

Assessing compost amended with different Trichoderma sp. as a means to control Phytophthora blight.

Interesting study investigating seed coat BCA.

Precursor study to the 2018 study. Repeat application had no effect. Propagule type played a large role, chlamydospores more infective than sporangium. Secondary drench appears effective. Exploring how Melatonin acts as a biocontrol agent. Exploration of the host transcriptome in response to melatonin. Simple article but clear and concise

This study focuses on the potential of compost to be used in bio-control. The results are primarily that Compost is complicated and full of variables. Not overly convincing.

Some of the methodology reasoning is poorly explained. Anthocyanin assessed in response to recognition that inoculated plants with P. eupatorii were presenting darker leaves.

Studying investigating whether an invasive weed plant might harbour endophytic bacteria useful for biocontrol purposes. Excellent methodology delving into the actual mechanisms behind the biological control. General article looking at endophytes from Curcubits.

GC-MS used to identify volatile compounds produced by A8a.

Study is primarily investigating compost and it's role in reducing phythopathogenic agents within the compost.

This study was only tangentially interested in the biological control of phytophthora.

The methods are a bit unusual and are somewhat worrying. Transcriptomics component.

Study was broadly focused on three pathogens, not just Phytophthora.

This study aimed to test a patented biological control agent in an actual field trial.

Investigating the molecular mechanisms of triggered defense from the plant side. Well constructed experimental design and statistical analysis.

Succinct article. SEM used to visualize the BC/Pathogen interaction.

The written English is somewhat broken and numerous words are misused.

Genome sequenced for the most effective organism, Pseudomonas 06c 126 embank accession SAMN05727803